#### **MINUTES OF THE**

#### **CITY OF PATASKALA BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS**

#### **Tuesday, July 12, 2016**

The City of Pataskala Board of Zoning Appeals convened in Council Chambers, City Hall, 621 West Broad Street, Pataskala, Ohio on Tuesday, July 12, 2016.

Present were:

Matt Dixon, Chairman Kathleen Hasson T.J. Rhodeback Steve Valentine

City of Pataskala Planning and Zoning Department staff: Scott Fulton, Director of Planning Lisa Paxton, Zoning Clerk

Not Present:

Catherine Baird, Vice Chairman

Chairman Dixon opened the hearing at 6:30 p.m., followed by the Pledge of Allegiance. Roll call was made. Present were: Matt Dixon, Kathleen Hasson, Steve Valentine and T.J. Rhodeback.

First on the Agenda, *Conditional Use Application CA-16-005.* (Please see the attached official transcript of proceedings).

Next on the Agenda, Variance Application VA-16-016

Ryan Lammers, 110 Ashley Lane, was placed under oath.

Mr. Lammers gave an overview of his variance request, noting the approved construction permit showing a 110-foot setback. Mr. Lammers indicated he had adjusted the layout, noting issues with access to the garage. Mr. Lammers stated he measured 100 feet, however, did not take into consideration the elevations and ended up with 96.7 foot setback.

Mr. Fulton reviewed his Staff Report and reiterated Mr. Lammers' comments.

Mr. Dixon asked if Mr. Lammers volunteered the error on his own.

Mr. Fulton noted in the affirmative.

Ms. Rhodeback asked if the neighbors were informed.

Mr. Lammers indicated in the affirmative and presented the neighbor's letter to the Board.

No further questions were presented.

Mr. Valentine made a motion to approve a variance from Section 1227.05(C)(1) and 1229.05(C)(3) of the Pataskala Code. Seconded by Ms. Hasson. Ms. Rhodeback, Mr. Valentine, Ms. Hasson and Mr. Dixon voted yes. The motion was approved.

Mr. Dixon noted the 30-day appeals process.

Next on the Agenda, Variance Application VA-16-017.

Thomas Nighland, 14441 East Broad Street, was placed under oath.

Mr. Nighland gave an overview of his variance request to build a 30 x 50 accessory building.

Mr. Dixon inquired into the use of the proposed accessory building.

Mr. Nighland noted recreational vehicles; camper, boat, motorcycles.

Mr. Dixon asked if the proposed accessory building will be used as a business.

Mr. Nighland indicated it would not.

Mr. Fulton gave an overview of his Staff Report, noting the property contains a 2,172 square foot home and a 480 square foot detached garage. Mr. Fulton stated the Applicant is proposing to construct a 1,500 square foot accessory building southeast of the existing garage. Mr. Fulton noted based upon the acreage of the property, the Code allows a maximum of 1,578 square feet that can be combined amongst two accessory building. Once combined, the existing detached garage and the proposed accessory building total will be 1,980 square feet; being 402 square feet over the maximum permitted square footage for accessory buildings on this property.

Ms. Rhodeback inquired as to the height of the proposed building.

Mr. Nighland noted the eave height would be 10 foot, and peak would be 14 feet.

Ms. Rhodeback asked the height of the current accessory building.

Mr. Nighland did not know the height; however, Mr. Nighland stated the proposed building will look equal to the existing building.

The Board reviewed the site map.

Ms. Hasson asked if there would be any living space.

Mr. Nighland indicated there would not be any living space.

Ms. Rhodeback asked if it will store a fifth wheel.

Mr. Nighland stated there would be a pop-up camper and pontoon.

Ms. Hasson asked if it will be his personal items.

Mr. Nighland indicated in the affirmative.

Ms. Rhodeback asked if there is a percentage in the code regarding overage.

Mr. Fulton indicated there is not.

No further questions were presented.

Ms. Hasson made a motion to approve a variance from Section 1221.05(B)(1) of the Pataskala Code for Variance Application VA-16-017, with the following *modifications*:

- 1. The applicant shall construct the accessory building as submitted within one (1) year of the date of approval.
- 2. The applicant shall obtain all necessary permits from the City of Pataskala and the Licking County Building Department prior to construction of the accessory building.

Seconded by Mr. Valentine. Ms. Hasson, Mr. Valentine and Mr. Dixon voted yes. Ms. Rhodeback voted no. The motion was approved.

Mr. Dixon noted the 30-day appeal period.

Next on the Agenda, Findings of Fact.

Mr. Dixon noted no findings of facts for the revocation for Conditional Use CU-16-005, per the City's Attorney. The minutes will be reviewed and approved at the next hearing.

Ms. Rhodeback made a motion to accept from Section 1211.07(1) *Findings of Fact A through K and for Section 1211.07(2) Findings of Fact A and B* for Variance Application VA-16-016. Ms. Hasson seconded the motion. Ms. Rhodeback, Mr. Dixon, Mr. Valentine and Ms. Hasson voted yes. The motion was approved.

Ms. Hasson made a motion to approve *Findings of Fact B, D, E, F, G, H and K for Variance Application VA-* **16-017.** Ms. Rhodeback seconded the motion. Mr. Dixon, Mr. Valentine, Ms. Rhodeback and Ms. Hasson voted yes. The motion was approved.

Mr. Valentine made a motion to approve the June 14, 2016 regular meeting minutes. Seconded by Ms. Hasson. Mr. Dixon, Ms. Hasson, Mr. Valentine and Ms. Rhodeback voted yes. The motion was approved.

Ms. Rhodeback made the motion to adjourn the meeting at 8:29 p.m. Seconded by Mr. Valentine. Mr. Valentine, Ms. Rhodeback, Ms. Hasson and Mr. Dixon voted yes. The meeting was adjourned.

Minutes of the July 12, 2016 Board o	of Zoning Appeals Meeting were approved on
	, 2016
Chairman Matt Dixon	

# CITY OF PATASKALA

BOARD OF PLANNING AND ZONING

Public Hearing and Regular Monthly Meeting

Tuesday Evening Session

July 12, 2016, 6:30 p.m.

CITY HALL, COUNCIL CHAMBERS 621 West Broad Street Pataskala, Ohio 43062

# **BEFORE:**

Matt Dixon, Chairman Kathleen Hasson Teresa (TJ) Rhodeback Stephen Valentine

### STAFF:

Lisa Paxton, Zoning Clerk Scott Fulton, Director of Zoning

# ALSO:

Brian M. Zets, City's Attorney Dwight Harlor

				2
1		EXHIBITS		
2			IDENTIFIED	
3	Exhibit	Description		
4	А	Application for Conditional Use Permit	7	
5	В	Hearing notification letter document	10	
7	С	Finding of Facts-Conditional Use Application document	12	
8	D	Violation letter	16	
9	E	Letter dated May 5, 2016	22	
10	F	Letter dated June 6, 2016	26	
11	G	Photographs	37	
12	Н	Photographs and brochure	51	
13	I	Various documents	54	
14				
15				
<ul><li>16</li><li>17</li></ul>				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				

```
3
 1
                       PROCEEDING
 2
 3
                  MR. DIXON: It is 6:37. We call this
 4
     meeting to order. If you will please rise for the
 5
     Pledge of Allegiance.
 6
                  (Pledge of Allegiance taken.)
 7
                  If you -- if everyone could, if you have
 8
     a cell phone, please silence it this evening, and
 9
     could we have a roll call of the Board members
10
     please?
11
                  MS. PAXTON: Matt Dixon?
12
                  MR. DIXON: Here.
13
                  MS. PAXTON: Catherine Baird? Kathleen
14
     Hasson?
15
                  MS. HASSON: Here.
16
                  MS. PAXTON: Stephen Valentine?
17
                  MR. VALENTINE: Here.
18
                  MS. PAXTON: TJ Rhodeback?
19
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Here.
20
                  MR. DIXON: All right. Our first order
21
     of business tonight is conditional use application
     CU-16-005. It is for the consideration of the
22
23
     revocation of this conditional use. Here to
24
     represent the City and the City's attorney Brian
```

```
4
 1
     Zests -- Zets. I'm sorry.
 2
                  MR. ZETS: No, you're not the first one.
 3
     It sounds like the Mets or the Jets, but with a Z.
 4
                  MR. DIXON: Okay.
 5
                  MR. ZETS: You will never forget it now,
 6
     and you can always spell it with more than one T too,
 7
    by the way.
 8
                  MR. DIXON: Okay.
9
                  MR. ZETS: It's often misspelled even
10
     though it's only four letters. I am the lawyer for
11
     the City. Mr. Chairman, I won't be actually
     testifying tonight, so I don't believe I need to be
12
13
     sworn in, but I will be asking questions of the two
14
     witnesses that we have present here tonight for this
15
    portion of the hearing.
16
                  The first will be Mr. Scott Fulton, so
17
     if you want to just go ahead and start the
18
    proceeding. I can -- we can have him sworn in and we
19
     can start this part of the --
20
                  MR. DIXON: That would be great if we
21
     could have Mr. Fulton sworn in.
22
                           SCOTT FULTON,
23
    being first duly sworn, as prescribed by law, was
24
     examined and testified as follows:
```

#### DIRECT EXAMINATION

By MR. ZETS:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Q. Scott, I'll remind you and I'll remind everyone else, I'll remind myself as well, we have a court reporter here tonight with us, and she's trying very hard to take down every word we say. Court reporters do not like people talking over each other because when we talk over each other, which is what we do every single day when you're at Starbucks and enjoying a coffee, and you're talking about last night's OSU game, we talk all over on top of each other, that makes for a horrible transcript because the court reporter cannot write what two people say at one time. So I would suggest that -- I'll try and -- ask you the questions, let me get the question out as best I can, I will let you give an answer. At some point in time if the Board has questions, you have -- -- feel free to also ask questions. If you do some -- you know, ask questions of the witnesses, and I'll also just ask that you refrain from trying to talk over each other or over the witnesses because -- if we can try to avoid that to make the most clearest transcript that we can put together.

and I also say to read anything, if I give you an exhibit, and you read really, really fast, she can't type as fast as you can read, that's just the rule of thumb. So if you start to read something, try and read slowly, so she can take it into the record. Got it?

A. Yes.

Q. Oh, and you also have to answer audibly, because if you just shake your head, she'll have a hard time, you know -- nodding is hard, "uh-huh", huh-uh" those are difficult too. No one ever knows what you really mean, yes or no, whatever you give so. Okay.

Mr. Fulton, just -- we all know who you are, but can you state your name and position for the record.

- A. Scott Fulton, Director of Planning for the City of Pataskala.
- Q. As Director for Planning in the City of Pataskala, some of your job duties entail issues and circumstances involving conditional use permits?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. I'm going to hand you what's been marked as Exhibit A.

7 1 (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.) 2 Ο. And I put the sticker on the wrong 3 exhibit, so let me mark a different one. Now, I know 4 the Board received a packet of information tonight. 5 Exhibit A, I'll -- just so -- so the record is clear, 6 is the application for conditional use permit, City 7 of Pataskala, application No. 2012-004. Scott, I'll 8 hand you that and ask if you can identify that 9 Exhibit A? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Ο. And what is that? 12 That is an application for conditional Α. 13 use permit. 14 Okay. And for -- what -- strike that. Ο. 15 What's the name of the applicant for that Exhibit A? 16 Α. Dwight Harlor, and I apologize if I 17 don't say this correctly, Yungrang Cheng. 18 Could you spell that for the court Q. 19 reporter? 20 Y-u-n-g-r-a-n-g, C-h-e-n-g. Α. 21 Okay. Thank you. And what was the Q. 22 address of the property location for this 23 application? 24 That is 12684 Broad Street in Pataskala. Α.

- Q. Okay. And just so we're clear, that is the property address for the location we're talking about with respect to this conditional use, which we're here for tonight, correct?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Exhibit A consists of three pages, I'll turn your attention to Page 2. I believe it's the third paragraph down. It starts with the phrase "On the exterior of the property..." Do you see where I'm at?
- A. Yes.

- Q. Okay. Could you read that slowly for us?
  - A. "On the exterior of the property, we plan to remove the existing sign(s) and replace with a 'more modern', 'nice looking' sign."
  - Q. Continue.
  - A. "Also, we wish to install a 6-foot privacy fence on the back of the property. Nice trees and shrubs are in the plans to improve the look of the property."
- Q. Okay. I'd like to turn your attention
  to Page 3 of Exhibit A. There's two numbered
  paragraphs on that page, 4 and 5. Could you read No.

4 for us please?

- A. "Yard: 6-foot privacy fence backyard with shading area for outdoor playground. Separate areas will be provided for different sizes of dogs. There will also be a fresh water running fountain outdoors in the summer."
- Q. Okay. And, then, No. 5, can you read that please?
- A. "The yard/play areas will be continuously cleaned of feces. This will be a ongoing process. We will dispose of waste in compliance with local, state, federal laws."
- Q. Pages 2 and 3 of Exhibit A, were these the commitments made by the applicant with respect to this application for conditional use?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. We'll just back up briefly just so the Board -- they probably remember what had happened, but this was four years ago almost. Can you explain succinctly to the Board why there was an application in need for a conditional use of this property and location?
- A. The applicant was proposing to establish a dog daycare and indoor boarding which is a

conditional use. It required a conditioned use approval through the Board of Zoning and Appeals.

- Q. In other words, they couldn't use the property as such without the conditional use?
  - A. Yes.

- Q. And while we look at what happened in between, but on the first page of Exhibit A, there's an approved stamped on there. So this is also the application and, I guess, the approval form as well?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And it shows the date of decision as being what on the approval of the conditional use?
  - A. January 24, 2012.
- Q. Even I can't read the signature, so I'm not sure if any of these Board members were involved in that or not. I see head shakes, no, so -- all right. Mr. Fulton, I'm going to hand you what's about to be marked as Exhibit B.

# (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)

Q. And that is going to be the City of Pataskala Board of Zoning and Appeals public hearing. It says hearing date January 24th, 2012. It has the application number, staff summary. The total exhibit is three pages. Would you identify that for us?

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

- Q. What is that?
- A. This is a Board of Zoning and Appeals
  Staff Report for the conditional use request.
- Q. Did you put together this Staff Report for the January 2012, meeting?
  - A. No.
  - Q. I assume your predecessor did?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Do you believe what's been marked as Exhibit B is a true and accurate copy of the Staff Report for this particular application, that being application No. 2012-004?
- A. Yes.
  - Q. And in the staff summary, the first paragraph basically summarizes what you just told the Board tonight about the request for the conditional use to operate the private kennel?
    - A. Yes.
- Q. Then if you turn to Page 2 of Exhibit B,
  halfway down the page, Paragraph No. 7, Section
  1229.04 conditional use. It talks about NAICS,
  provisions. Could you explain to the Board what that
  is and how it relates to this matter we're here on

today?

- A. The NAICS is the North American

  Industrial Classification System, and that system has been incorporated into our zoning code by which to indicate permitted, conditional permitted, and non-permitted uses in a given zoning classification.
- Q. Again, in order to run -- well, let me back up. What was the business again that the applicant was trying to operate at this facility?
- A. Dog boarding and indoor boarding and dog daycare.
- Q. Okay. And they could not do that without a conditional use, correct?
  - A. Correct.
- Q. I'm going to hand you what's been marked as Exhibit C.
- 17 (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
  - Q. The top is captioned, "City of Pataskala Board of Zoning and Appeals Findings of Facts, Conditional Use Application No. 2012-004", and ask you if you can identify that for me?
    - A. Yes.
  - Q. Do you believe it's a true and accurate copy of the findings of facts from the BZA with

respect to this application?

A. Yes.

- Q. All right. Looking at the first page of Exhibit C, there's a paragraph, if you want to call it that, where it says "findings", and, then, there's handwritten notes in there. Could you read that for us please, the handwritten portion?
- A. "The application was approved with the requirement that they stick the fencing as stated in the application."
- Q. Okay. Then it goes on to -- I believe, it's explains why the BZA believes that the conditional use criteria were met, correct, in A, B, C, and D, and E?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. It continues on to F, G, and H as well, correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
  - Q. Then the very last thing above the signature lines is the motion. Could you read the motion into the record please?
  - A. "Move to approve the application with strict adherence to the commitments including the fencing."

- Q. And, again, commitments that were on the application were the items you talked about in Exhibit A on Pages 2 and 3, correct?
  - A. Correct.

- Q. So what was your understanding of what needed to be done by the applicant in order to meet the criteria for the conditional use?
- A. That the existing signs needed to be removed, the installation of a 6-foot privacy fence, trees and shrubs were to be planted. Also, separate areas for different sizes of dogs in the backyard, a running fountain during the summer months, shaded areas, and that the feces be removed in compliance with local, state, and federal laws.
- Q. All right. And that finding, again, was dated January 24th, 2012, correct?
- A. Yes.
  - Q. When did you actually start as the director with the City of Pataskala?
    - A. October 13th, 2014.
- Q. When did you first become aware of issues with this property and the conditional use permit?
- A. Approximately March of 2016.

Q. Do you remember how you became aware of those issues?

- A. I believe we had some complaints that came through the police department to us related to the care of the dogs at this location.
- Q. What do you mean by the "care of the dogs at this location"?
- A. We received a letter stating that the dogs weren't being cared for appropriately. They weren't being walked, some had medical issues and were not being treated, and, then, they were being in crates for extended periods of time. There were instances of dog bites, dogs killing dogs, dogs attacking other dogs in terms of the alpha male disciplining the lower subordinate dogs, that was outlined in a letter that went to the police department that they forwarded on to us to go take a look into it.
- Q. Okay. So after you received that complaint letter outlining those things you described, what did you do?
- A. We looked into whether there was a conditional use for the property to determine what the approved use was for the property, that's when we

- 1 found out that the conditions that needed to be met.
- 2 We also, at that time, we were contracted with
- 3 Fairfield County and they did an investigation of the
- 4 property to determine if there was any violations.
- 5 Q. Okay. What conclusion did you come to
- 6 with respect to whether the conditions or commitments
- 7 that the applicant set forth in order to meet the
- 8 | conditional use were being complied with?
- 9 A. The conclusion -- we took a look at the
- 10 | property and concluded that only one of the required
- 11 | conditions had been met.
- Q. Okay. And this, again, is March of this
- 13 | year 2016, correct?
- 14 A. Correct.
- Q. All right. I'm going to hand you what's
- 16 been marked as Exhibit D. It is a violation letter
- 17 dated March 31st, 2016, to Dwight Harlor,
- 18 H-a-r-l-o-r. I ask if you can identify that for me,
- 19 please?
- 20 (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. What is Exhibit D?
- A. This is a violation letter sent by me to
- 24 Mr. Harlor indicating that he has not met the

- commitments made as part of the conditional use approval, and that he needed to resolve this matter within ten days or it could result in the revocation of his conditional use approval.
  - Q. Okay. And, again, who is Dwight Harlor?
- A. Dwight Harlor was one of the applicants for the original conditional use approval for the property.
- Q. Okay. In this letter -- strike that.

  Let me start with this one: How was the letter

  that's been marked as Exhibit D sent to Mr. Harlor?
  - A. It was by certified mail.
- Q. And I assume you did get a return receipt?
- 15 A. Yes.

- Q. Okay. That -- actually the signature page is Page 2 of Exhibit D; is that correct?
- 18 A. Yes.
  - Q. All right. In the letter dated

    March 31st, 2016, you outlined eight commitments that

    were made. I want to walk you through these one by

    one. Before I do that, let me ask you before you had

    sent the letter that's been marked as Exhibit D on

    March 31st, 2016, did you personally observe the

- property and the condition with respect to these commitments?
- A. Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

18

19

- Q. Okay. Starting with No. 1, "Removal of the existing sign or signs", had that been accomplished as of March 31st, 2016?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. No. 2, "Installation of a new sign that is a -- that is 'more modern' and 'nice looking.'"

  Had Mr. Harlor installed this new more modern, nicer looking sign as of March 31st, 2016?
- 12 A. No.
- Q. Moving to No. 3, "Installation of a

  "6-foot privacy fence on the back part of the

  property." Had that been completed as of March 31st,

  2016?
- 17 A. No.
  - Q. No. 4, "Installation of 'nice' trees and shrubs." It's somewhat subjective, but were there any trees or shrubs installed as of March 31st, 2016?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. How about nice trees or shrubs?
- 23 A. No.
- Q. None of those either?

A. No, sir.

- Q. No. 5, "Installation of a shading area for an outdoor playground in the yard." We're talking about play -- you're talking about a playground area for the dogs, correct?
  - A. Correct.
- Q. Okay. Had that been installed as of March 31st, 2016?
  - A. No.
- Q. No. 7, "Installation of a freshwater running fountain in the yard." Had he installed that fountain as of March 31st, 2016?
  - A. No.
- Q. And Finally No. 8, "Cleaning of the yard and play area of feces that will be disposed of in compliance with local, state, and federal laws." Did you see signs of feces that had not been cleaned up?
- A. I did not, however, I don't know if the disposal method was in compliance with local, state and federal laws.
- Q. Fair enough. The next paragraph of
  Exhibit D explains you are currently in violation of
  the conditional use permit. "Failure to resolve this
  matter within 10 days could result in revocation of

- the conditional use approval." Did Mr. Harlor resolve these eight issues within ten days of the date you sent this letter?
- A. No.

- Q. Now, just to be clear, how about 10 days of the date that he received it, which apparently is April 18, 2016?
  - A. No.
  - Q. Did Mr. Harlor contact you at any time after receiving or within a close time of receiving this letter?
- 12 A. Yes, I believe it was related to this letter.
- Q. Okay. Do you remember what he said and what he -- why he contacted you?
  - A. I believe it was to respond to these issues in an attempt to work through the issues to be in compliance with the requirements.
  - Q. Okay. Explain to the BZA how that conversation went and what he proposed to do or --
  - A. I believe it was an e-mail. He indicated that he had a sign for the property, however, while reviewing that sign, the photo was taken in 2012. The sign was never installed, plus

the sign was associated with Bark Avenue, which is -although proposed for the property, it has never
opened, so that business does not currently exist at
the property. And, then, Mr. Harlor, if I recall,
went through this list and indicated how he was
currently in compliance or planning to be in
compliance.

- Q. Okay. With respect to the planning to be in compliance, what did he tell you his efforts were going to be and the time frame with which he hoped to get them done?
- A. He indicated just for example that he was going to be installing trees and shrubs, that the fence and existing trees qualified as shading areas for the outdoor playground. He was planning on continuing to install the fence, however, he had proposed a building addition to the east side of the property that would result in him removing the fence, which is why he didn't complete it.

Also, he said that he had the -separated the yard into different areas with certain
equipment that could be installed in 20 or
30 minutes. This is just from memory, so I'm
probably not touching on all of them.

- Q. Okay. Did he give you a time frame by which he could get things all done?
  - A. Not that I recall.
- Q. Do you remember if you gave him any direction as to when these things should be done?
  - A. Not that I recall.
- Q. Okay. Let me fast forward you to May of 2016, in particular. I'll show you what's been marked as Exhibit E. It's a letter dated May 5th, 2016.
- 11 (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
- Q. Would you identify that exhibit for me, please?
- 14 A. Yes.

- 15 O. What is Exhibit E?
  - A. That was a letter sent to Mr. Harlor indicating that the commitments made as part of the application have still not been met, and that they must be completed by June 1st of this year to be fully compliant with the approved conditional use application.
    - Q. Okay. And a letter dated May 5th, 2016, which has been marked as Exhibit E, that was sent by certified mail?

A. Yes.

- Q. And Page 2 of Exhibit E, is that the green card, if you will, I like to call it, showing the return signed for mail?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. All right. So regardless of actually what -- whether or not you can remember what time table you gave Mr. Harlow -- or Harlor in March, if you can fast forward to the beginning of May -- again, you sent a letter identifying eight criteria or commitments that were made by him with respect to the conditional use; is that correct?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. All right. And if you look down through the eight commitments, can you identify for the Board which ones were met as of May 5th, 2016?
  - A. No. 1.
  - Q. Okay. Any others?
- A. Possibly No. 8, but, again, there was no documentation provided indicating how the feces removal was in compliance with all applicable laws.
- Q. So No's. 2 through 7 were still not complied with as of May 5th, 2016?
- A. Correct.

- Q. And just so the Board knows, did you personally observe the property at or around the time -- actually before the time you sent the letter dated May 5th, 2016?
  - A. Yes.

- Q. And the letter that's been marked as Exhibit E, you say, "The above mentioned items must be completed and rectified by June 1st, 2016, in order to be fully compliant with your approved conditional use application. Failure to do so by specified date will result in the scheduling of a Board of Zoning and Appeals hearing to consider the revocation of your conditional use approval." Why did you put that in the letter May 5th, 2016?
- A. There's a provision in the code that says if there is a complaint about someone not following the requirements of their conditional use, that a conditional use can be revoked for those reasons.
- Q. I have the sheet here, but I'm going to ask you do you know what that number is?
  - A. 120 -- 1212, 1213.
- Q. Very close. I will show you this to see if it refreshes your memory. It's actually a copy of

- the code. I got it this afternoon.
  - A. Okay.

- Q. That's code section -- if that -- does that refresh your memory to which number -- I apologize. I'm not trying to give you a quiz or a test here, but I know you're pretty good at these numbers.
  - A. Would you like me --
- Q. Yeah. Well, no, just a code number just so -- to make sure the Board is on the same page as you.
- A. 1215.09, Expiration and Revocation of Conditional Use Permit.
- Q. Okay. After you had sent the letter marked as Exhibit E and Mr. Harlor had received it, did you have any conversations with Mr. Harlor?
  - A. I did.
- Q. Could you explain to the Board what those were?
- A. Again, it was touching upon some of the specifics from our previous conversation that the fence wasn't installed because of the building addition. He was planning on putting in trees and shrubs, and, then, that he could install the

- separation in the backyard in 20 or 30 minutes, and that there was already shade there, that he didn't need to install the shading areas for the outdoor playground. He essentially recapped what we previously discussed.
- Q. Well, what did you tell him at this time? You had a conversation with him at the end of March. He gave you these reasons/excuses, what did you tell him that he needed to complete at the beginning of May?
- A. I said that the way the conditional use was approved, it was with strict adherence to the commitments made including the fencing.
- Q. What if, anything, did he say in response?
- A. I don't recall.

17 (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)

- Q. I'm going to hand you what's been marked as Exhibit F. It's a letter dated June 6th, 2016, to Mr. Harlor. I ask if you can identify that exhibit for me, please?
- A. Yes.

- Q. What is Exhibit F?
- A. It's a letter to Mr. Harlor indicating

- 1 he did not meet the commitments by the deadline of June 1st, 2016, therefore, pursuant to Section 3 1215.09 of the Code, a formal complaint has been 4 issued and a revocation date was sent for a hearing 5 date.
  - All right. Now, Exhibit F, whose Q. signature is that at the bottom of Exhibit F?
    - Α. Benjamin J. King.
    - Who is Mr. King? Q.
    - Α. He's the City's administrator.
    - Why did Mr. King send the letter that's Q. been marked Exhibit F, and you sent the letters that were marked Exhibit D and E?
    - With that, it's a -- one of the provisions of that section of the code, it says if the city official makes a complaint, that a letter will be sent, and a revocation hearing would be set. I spoke to Mr. King in regards to this and he said he would write the letter --
      - Ο. Okay.
      - -- formally issuing a complaint.
- 22 Q. Did you review the content of this 23 letter with Mr. King before it had been sent?
- 24 Α. Yes.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- Q. Had you personally observed the property at or before June 6th, the time when this letter was drafted and sent?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Did you agree with the items -- the issues that were listed and identified in Exhibit F before Mr. King sent the letter?
  - A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And how is Exhibit F mailed to
- 10 Mr. Harlor?

1

2

3

4

8

15

16

17

- 11 A. Certified mail.
- Q. I believe it shows on Exhibit F a delivery date of June 8th, 2016; is that correct?
- 14 A. Yes.
  - Q. Looking, again, at the items listed one through eight, it appears to be the same items that were listed in the previous letters, correct?
- 18 A. Yes.
- Q. When you personally observed the property at or before June 6th, explain to the Board which one of those items one through eight had been complied with in your opinion?
  - A. One and possibly eight.
- Q. So nothing basically had changed since

March 31st?

- A. No.
- Q. After Mr. -- Harlow -- Harlor had signed for the letter on June 8th, 2016, did you have any contact with him?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Explain to the Board what that was -- conversation was about and what was discussed?
- A. Mr. Harlor previously had an approved fence permit which had since expired, so Mr. Harlor came back in to apply for the fence permit so that he could install the fence. Also, he mentioned that he had a sign permit that had since expired so he came back in, I believe, to reapply for a sign permit.

Also, we discussed the situation that since Bark Avenue was not currently operating at that location that the Bark Avenue sign per the code would not be permitted to be installed to satisfy requirement No. 2. And since Charlie's Wish was the only facility operating from that location, a Charlie's Wish sign would be the only sign per the code that would be permitted to meet requirement No. 2.

Q. When was the last time you observed this

property?

- A. This morning.
- Q. And as of this morning, do you believe the written terms and conditions upon which the application for the conditional use was granted had been met?
  - A. No.
- Q. Has anything changed, and what I mean by that is with respect -- outside of No. 1 and No. 8, have any of these other commitments been satisfied?
- A. While subjective, Mr. Harlor did install some shrubs.
  - Q. Okay. We'll start with that one.

    Explain to the Board the types of shrubs that you
    saw.
  - A. They're very small shrubs outside of the existing sign post, and while it's subjective, nice and it's -- it -- everybody has their own opinion, but I believe nice trees and shrubs leads me to believe that there will be more installation of landscaping rather than a few shrubs here and there, maybe three or four.
  - Q. Okay. Any other commitments that have been satisfied as of the last time you saw the

property?

A. Mr. Harlor did complete the fence along the eastern side of the portion -- or the property. However, in the back, there's a gap where the fence is still not complete. Also, there is large gaps underneath the newly installed fence that if dogs were to be let out into the backyard, they can easily get under the fence and escape.

Q. Okay. Any of the other eight items?

A. No.

MR. ZETS: I don't have any other questions for Mr. Fulton at this time. I guess if the applicant has questions of Mr. Fulton, he should probably ask them now. I guess it's your hearing, but I would assume that's how it will be run.

MR. DIXON: Yes. You want to call any more witnesses at --

MR. ZETS: Yes. I mean, I'm going to call -- I'm going to call Steve Blake just for two minutes worth of questions.

MR. DIXON: Okay. Is Mr. Harlor here?

MR. HARLOR: Yes, I am.

MR. DIXON: Do you have any questions?

MR. HARLOR: I am trying to comply with

```
this --
```

2 MR. DIXON: Anything -- if you could, 3 come to the podium.

MR. HARLOR: I did not know that there was going to be an attorney in here. I thought I was trying to meet this. We got in this to help dogs, to rescue dogs.

MR. DIXON: Mr. Harlor, if you could, I'm going to have to get you sworn in and everything.

MR. HARLOR: All right. I will.

MR. ZETS: I would also suggest that if he has questions for Mr. Fulton, he can ask those now. If he has a statement that he wants to make to the Board, he'll have time to do that after I get done asking Mr. Blake those questions, so just to keep a proper order of a witness, the cross-examination, which he's entitled to a witness cross-examination. You can put your hands down if you want, too. And, just to keep the order so that the record is clear.

MR. DIXON: Mr. Harlor, if you would get sworn in, please.

(Dwight Harlor sworn.)

CROSS-EXAMINATION

33 1 BY MR. HARLOR: 2 MR. DIXON: Okay. 3 MR. HARLOR: Thank you. Scott, can go 4 through -- I want to see what the questions are. 5 MR. FULTON: Uh-huh. 6 I'll walk over. I tried very hard to Ο. 7 get some of this stuff done. Okay. Where are we on 8 the questions? 9 Here's all of the exhibits. Α. 10 Where are we? Just go through the list Ο. 11 of what -- the compliance stuff. 12 Α. That would be the removal of the 13 existing sign. 14 No, there were three signs there, there 15 were 16 foot 5 by 5 --16 MR. DIXON: Mr. Harlor? 17 MR. HARLOR: What? MR. DIXON: I'm sorry, I have to 18 19 interrupt you. This is -- we're running this kind of 20 like a court case, so instead of stating the facts of 21 your case, but if there's any questions for 22 Mr. Fulton at this time, it will just be strict 23 questions. MR. HARLOR: So I can't say anything?

```
1
                  MR. DIXON: Well, you can ask him
 2
     questions at this point in time. You will have time
 3
     at the end to actually present your case. This is
 4
     actually the City's time --
 5
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay.
 6
                  MR. DIXON: -- and this is just like a
 7
     cross examination, I guess I'm trying to say. So if
 8
     you want to step to the podium over here, so we got
 9
     you -- it's got to be on the microphone, sorry, and
10
     if you have any questions strictly for Mr. Fulton --
11
                  MR. HARLOR: Go through the guestions if
12
     you would, please.
13
                  No. 1, Removal of the existing sign --
14
     signs -- signs.
15
                  MR. HARLOR: Can I say anything?
16
                  MR. DIXON: Basically right now, this is
17
     just questions for him to -- if you want to ask him a
     question about it -- it's almost, like, you're an
18
19
     attorney representing yourself, and just ask him any
20
     questions you have. Like I said, any statements
21
     about that, actually have to come more when it's your
22
     turn to present.
23
                  MR. HARLOR: I guess No. 2, please?
24
                  "Installation of a new sign that is
             Α.
```

```
1
     'more modern' and 'nice looking." Installation of a
 2
     6-foot privacy fence on the back of the property.
 3
     Installation of 'nice' trees and shrubs.
 4
     Installation of a shading area for an outdoor
 5
     playground in the yard. Installation of separate
 6
     areas in the yard for dogs of different sizes.
 7
     Installation of a fresh water fountain -- fresh water
 8
     running fountain in the yard. Cleaning of the yard
9
     in the play areas of feces that will be disposed of
10
     in compliance by local, state, and federal laws."
11
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay.
12
                  MR. DIXON: Do you have any other
13
     questions for Mr. Fulton at this time?
14
                  MR. HARLOR: No, but I do want to go
15
     through one-on-one and --
16
                  MR. DIXON: We'll get to that after the
17
     City finishes his case.
18
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay. Okay. That's fine.
19
     I did not know that there was going to be an attorney
20
     here to represent, because we did have an attorney
21
     against this lady that made these false accusations.
     I have this -- I don't have them marked like an
22
23
     attorney does, but --
24
                  MR. DIXON: Okay. We will let --
```

MR. HARLOR: -- nothing much was found in this investigation, I can tell you that.

MR. DIXON: Okay. We will give you your chance to present.

MR. ZETS: At this time, I have no further questions for Mr. Fulton. I would like to have Mr. Steve Blake to be sworn in, so I can ask him just a couple quick questions, if you would, please.

9 MR. DIXON: Mr. Blake, if you could get 10 sworn in, please?

11 STEVEN BLAKE,

being first duly sworn, as prescribed by law, was examined and testified as follows:

14 DIRECT EXAMINATION

15 By MR. ZETS:

3

4

5

6

7

8

18

19

20

21

- Q. Could you state your name and spell it for the record, please?
  - A. Steven Blake, S-t-e-v-e-n, B-l-a-k-e.
  - Q. And I'm sure the people who are on the Board know who you are, but for purposes of the record, could you explain your position and when you started with the City?
- A. I'm the zoning inspector for the City
  and I started September 15th, 2015.

- Q. The property we're talking about here today is located at 12684 Broad Street, Pataskala. Are you familiar with that property?
  - A. Yes, I am.

- Q. And if you could explain briefly to the Board why you are familiar with that property.
- A. We had received some complaints about the property from the police department. Once, again, it involved the dogs, and, then, there was also some violations there regarding trash and debris and as part of my job, I did cite him for that, and some of those items were cleaned up. And, then, we also had an issue with the fence on the property too.
- Q. Okay. And that's what I would like to focus your attention on that, I believe, it was the 6-foot privacy fence, part of the commitments. Are you familiar with that?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. I'm going to hand you what's been marked as Exhibit G.
  - (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
- Q. It's five pages that are photographs.

  This is not part of the Board's packet, but I'll let

  you see them in one second once he identifies them.

Five pictures, and I ask if you can identify those photographs?

- A. Yes, these are photographs that I took of the fence at the property.
- Q. Okay. Is -- are these photographs time stamped?
- A. They're dated, today's date, and the time I took them was about approximately 4:15 this afternoon.
- Q. And what -- well, before I hand them to the Board, what were you looking to depict in those photographs? In other words, why did you take those photographs?
- A. One of the things that stood out is the fence was designed to be containing the dogs, and there are some large gaps in the front of the fence, which a dog could easily crawl under. Also, when I looked in the backyard, I noticed that the back fence had not been completed. There's approximately about an 8 to 10-foot section that is totally missing in the back fence. I'm also seeing no signs of any kind of additional shading or running water system that was supposed to have been installed.
  - Q. Just to be clear, these are true and

```
accurate copies of photos you took late this afternoon, correct?

A. Yes, they are.

MR. HARLOR: Could I see those, please?
```

Q. Prior to taking those photographs this afternoon, when was the last time you were at the property before then?

MR. ZETS: Absolutely.

- A. Oh, it was approximately about a month ago, just doing a follow-up inspection.
- Q. Okay. Was the fence depicted in those photographs installed about a month ago when you were there?
- 14 A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

- MR. ZETS: That's all I have. Thank
  you. Mr. Harlor, do you have any questions for this
  witness?
- MR. HARLOR: Can I ask about those?
- MR. ZETS: Well, yes.
- MR. DIXON: You're welcome to -- the
  witness is yours right now if you would like to ask
  him any questions about it.
- 23 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 24 BY MR. HARLOR:

```
1
             Q.
                  Mr. Blake has really tried to work with
 2
         I have approximately 37 2 by 6's under the front
 3
     porch, and if you look at this -- I mean, I have not
 4
     called you for a final inspection, but I'm -- I have
 5
     to fill those gaps in. I'm not stupid. I mean, the
 6
     dogs will get out. Okay? That's one, I did put some
 7
     examples of this -- of a couple of the shaded things
 8
     and the whole kennel of what we have. We only have
 9
     one size dogs right now.
10
                  MR. DIXON: Again, Mr. Harlor, if you
11
     have any questions for him or otherwise we can
     release the witness and you can present your case.
12
13
     Like I said, if you have any question for him --
                  MR. HARLOR: Go ahead and release him.
14
15
                  MR. DIXON: Okay. All right. If the
16
     City attorney will -- are you complete with your part
17
     of the motion?
18
                  MR. ZETS: Yes.
19
                  MR. DIXON: Okay. You're all done.
20
     You're welcome to come up and present your case and
21
     then if you like, you can call any witness as you may
```

MR. HARLOR: It's just me.

MR. DIXON: Okay.

like to call.

22

MR. HARLOR: Do I need to be swear in again?

MR. DIXON: No, we just got to you swear you once, that's all.

MR. HARLOR: Okay. I am Dwight Harlor. We bought this place with the intention of doing good things for animals. It's not what we needed for sure. I've had a lot of medical issues. I don't have a vertebrae in my neck -- my bone on -- and so forth -- and, then, I'm dealing with this attorney that I had hired that forged my name on a check, and cashed it to settle my case without my permission, and I have been to the Supreme Court of Ohio hearings over this. There are two felony charges against this guy. A Morrow County Sheriff called me up and said, hey, you better be careful. This guy pointed a gun at my husband and I on I-270 and Sawmill Road. I'm glad to provide you with all this.

On top of that, once he found that I had this check, a copy of a check, now he is suing me for \$30,000. He already lost his license for one to two years, and I just -- I'm overwhelmed before I started to get this stuff, but I mean, I just -- I thought the first certified letter was coming from

him, and I just -- I found out it was from them, and I tried to respond. But, anyway, like they're saying, we were trying to do -- what was Bark Avenue Hotels, LLC, and profits from that were going towards the Charlie's Wish Rescue. So we've had 64 adoptions, we got six pending. Our vet bills are already for 2016 are 15,240 bucks. We do get donations, but not that much.

Were a lot of verbal things from Jack and Diane
Harris before about this. I called Jack up, the
former building inspector, I said Jack, this -- this
is not going to work for what we want to do. We've
had the Columbus City vet out to look at it, and I've
had some architect guys, some builder guys to come
out and look at it and we would need to add this
siding onto the building at ground level so people in
wheelchairs and handicap people can at least -- could
come in, which we would welcome. I have one person
that would like to help us out that's in a
wheelchair.

As I said, I got this, I'm trying to comply with it, with everything I can. I was trying to put the fence up myself. I fell and broke a

couple ribs. I don't know. I just -- I don't know what else to say. But, I did -- I do have a sign that I paid \$1,600 for it. It's sandblasted, double sided sign, that was supposed to hang on the old pole. I think you guys have seen it. I'll send it around, which they said now since we're not operating that business, which was pending -- the last time I was here to get a conditional variance on the lot line, they won't let me put that sign up as of now until, you know -- we're over a month away from the business; is that correct, Scott?

MR. FULTON: Correct.

MR. HARLOR: I have tried to comply, some of the things that I thought -- like, the shaded areas. We really don't need the shaded areas, and the other thing about it is -- I mean, we have tents for shading, but this morning on the east side of the building, when the sun came up, the 6-foot fence itself at 8:00 a.m. provided a 14-foot shade area, believe it or not.

I have -- probably when Steven was over there today, I was probably at Sam's Club. I got a stack of pictures that everybody is welcome to look at. Here's one of the fountains that we have. You

can tell it's running. To be quite honest with you, the dogs were afraid of it. The rest went over and peed on it.

So as far as the feces go, I try to walk the dogs on the sidewalk, that is AEP's property. I try to pick up everything, and actually I started putting coins down on the sidewalk so when I went back with my Pooper Scooper and bucket that I could find it, now there's people who walk the sidewalks and pick the coins up. We tried to make the -- if you saw this building at first, it was horrible looking. It has improved a lot. It needs to improve a lot. I don't know if Mr. Blake verified, but that is all cleaned up now, all the trash is cleaned up if you want to see that.

I did get some help over the weekend to do everything. The gap in the back of the fence, I mean, 2 by 6's needs to be stacked to fill in any gaps under the fence. I'm working on that. I have not called him for a final inspection. The missing part of the fence on the back is the only fence part that I did not get done, and that is -- that's going to be a gate. I have to get mowers and tractors and so forth in the backyard.

The landscaping, I mean, it's not the greatest, but I tell you there's a very, very small patch out in the front of this, and I can tell you if you dig down in that yard is 3-foot of stone.

It's -- it is, like, solid stone all the way.

MR. DIXON: Could we see those pictures?

MR. HARLOR: Yeah. I made an attempt to do that. I mean, it's not perfect, that's for sure. I planted a couple small pine trees to try to comply. The front of the shaded areas -- we do have -- we've gotten donations from people, and we have this plastic fence that we could divide up areas. This is one of the kennel things that I set up with the temporary thing. We have hanging baskets on the front of it. The building looks so much better than it did.

And if I wouldn't had all of the medical issues I've had, things would be a lot further along. I was going to fly out to California to try to get an implant in my neck because I'm miserable. I'm on pain pills. I just -- and another thing, we will provide pet cremations for pets. We done it for a couple of our rescue pets, our own pets. We don't cremate pets onsite. We used a place called Pet

Cremation Services. They're the ones that go to all of the veterinarian offices in the area, and they -- you know, they're very professional. I've been down to their facility. We do not cremate pets at that time. I've been accused of about everything you can imagine, and I don't burn animals in the backyard. Okay?

These are the two storage sheds and the trees that had to be removed for a proposed site.

This is the stump where the tree was that's right behind those two sheds, and it was a mess. I apologize for that. It finally got cleaned up. Five different people took fire wood, and I got all the rest of it cleaned up this morning.

Can we go through your questions, Scott?

Can I ask that now?

MR. DIXON: He's no longer -- I guess

you can call him as a witness again. Could he or -
MR. ZETS: You know, you can allow the

leeway. He was given an opportunity to cross-examine

Mr. Fulton when Mr. Fulton was actually providing

testimony. I think, the Board can do that if they

want to offer some leniency, but usually this is the

time for an applicant to actually present his version

```
1 of the facts, but it's up to you.
```

2 MR. DIXON: Do you have a copy of the questions yourself?

4 MR. HARLOR: I don't have it with me.

5 Can I at least look at them?

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

6 MR. DIXON: Yeah. You can see them
7 yourself, and then if --

MR. HARLOR: Okay. That's -- that's 9 fair.

MR. DIXON: If you have some comments on those?

MR. HARLOR: No, sir. Okay. The signs were removed, as I said. There were three signs, a 16 foot by 5 by 5 ugly thing. The awning itself, said, Wellness One Stop Carry Out. The privacy fence, when Jack was the building inspector, and I said — he came out and we walked around and talked, and he said if you can get a variance on your lot line, just stop the fence, even with the back of the building, just over — if I did that with the privacy fence, then I would have needed to install it. It would have been about 14 feet, so that was a verbal thing from the former building inspector.

The nice trees and shrubs, they're

small. The other thing in my defense on the trees, the shrubs, and the front fence, when I was out there, there's one fence post in one side. I have to put a fence across that. I have to put a gate that's going to close because they steal everything that they can get their hands on down there. They stole my zero turn radius mower, which was about 3,000 bucks. I had stuff missing. I want to enclose the carport, if I keep this, which is going to be part of the decision here tonight, and -- you know, we're -- we're -- we have dogs there right now that are -- would have ended up in a plastic bag in the dump. I mean, we saved a lot of dogs.

And in that part of town, everybody said get in this, it's fun. It's not fun. I mean, I'm -- anyway, let's get back to the complaint. I do not have these things marked as an attorney would because I did not know that you were going to do this. We were represented in this case. This lady's name is Sherri Jolley. She's -- I've been told by someone that she's bipolar and she sits at home on her computer and cause a lot of problems, that was my description from other people. Dave was the guy that came from Fairfield County to do the inspection. I'm

in there one day taking care of the dogs, and I see this guy at the window with his hands --

MR. ZETS: I hate to object, but I think we're getting really far a field of the issue that's before the BZA at this point in time.

MR. HARLOR: I have a right to at least say something about this complaint that started all this, sir.

MR. DIXON: We'll hear your complaint, just try to narrow it down.

MR. HARLOR: Okay. These are e-mails, we were represented by a guy named Jeff Holland -Jeffrey Holland. He's in Sharon Center, Ohio. As I said, this guy came up, he had made a statement to
Laura that he wanted to come and look at a dog. I walked over to the -- I'm in the kitchen, and I see this guy looking in the windows. Well, there was a murder down the street. This guy had trespassed on the street. He did not have an appointment to be there.

Anyway, everything that I -- I don't know if you guys want to read this or without -- or how do you want to do this -- but nothing was found by the Fairfield County humane officer. I let him

```
in, I said look, you know, you're welcome to look around. I said I clean up after the dogs. I feed them. They are not mean. They're friendly, nothing was found.
```

MR. DIXON: Do we have that paperwork?

MR. HARLOR: I don't think so. I really don't.

MR. DIXON: Okay. Do you have that paperwork for us?

MR. HARLOR: Well, I have the -- Laura gave this to me in case I needed this, that's why I ran out to the car and got it because it was quite obvious it was going to be needed after, you know -- here I am up against an attorney. This is a letter from -- an apology letter from Sherri Jolley.

MR. ZETS: We'll -- give them that.

MR. HARLOR: Okay.

MR. ZETS: Because I want to make sure the record is clear. It has nothing to do with anything but the record. I know there's some pictures that were shown to the Board. I believe, those should be marked as an exhibit so they can be part of the record if there's ever an appeal. If you would like these e-mails or whatever you have there

```
1
     to be considered by the Board, I say we mark those as
 2
     an exhibit as well and include that as part of the
 3
     record, then everything is complete. If you don't
 4
     want to, that's fine, but I think if you want to,
 5
     then that's how it should be done.
 6
                  MR. HARLOR: Well I -- yeah, I think I
 7
     can leave them. I would -- to be quite honest with
 8
     you, I thought this was trying to comply with the
 9
     complaints. I didn't know we were going to get into
10
     the --
11
                  MR. DIXON: What exhibit are we on right
12
     now? I know we had D.
13
                  MR. ZETS: The photos should be H.
14
                  (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
15
                  MR. DIXON: We'll put all your -- if
16
     it's all right, we'll put all your photos as Exhibit
17
     H. Is that okay?
18
                  MR. HARLOR: Yeah, that's fine.
19
                  MR. DIXON: And we as a Board have seen
20
     all of your photos in Exhibit H and taken a look at
21
     them.
22
                  MR. ZETS: Also, included in these
23
    photos is a brochure for the Pets We Love, is that
24
     also included with the exhibit that is --
```

```
1
                  MR. HARLOR: Well, people have accused
 2
     me of burning pets in the backyard, and it's -- yes,
 3
     you can have that. They're very professional. They
 4
     come and pick the pet up, and take it down to their
 5
     cremation to this -- Frank Road area downtown.
 6
    been down there and they showed me around a little
 7
     bit.
 8
                  MR. ZETS: Okay. Exhibit H will be 11
 9
     photos, plus this brochure for the Pets We Love.
10
                  MR. DIXON: Okay. And you do not have
11
     the Fairfield County --
12
                  MR. HARLOR: Well, there is something in
13
     here, but nothing was found.
14
                  MR. DIXON: Can we -- can we mark that
15
     as an exhibit?
16
                  MR. HARLOR: Yeah.
17
                  MR. DIXON: And then we will take a look
18
     at it.
19
                  MR. HARLOR: Yeah. As far as I know --
20
                  MR. DIXON: We don't have that in our
21
    packets.
22
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay. Yeah. Yeah. I got
23
     a lot of stuff. I got the thing from the Department
24
     of Agriculture. I got our 501(c)(3) paperwork, this
```

```
53
 1
     is all of our attorneys, there is an apology from
 2
     Sherri Jolley who started this, which Charlie's Wish
 3
     Animal Rescue will file a lawsuit against her.
 4
                  MR. DIXON: Like I said, if you wanted
 5
     to make that an exhibit, but we haven't seen any of
 6
     that stuff so --
 7
                  MR. HARLOR: I didn't know to prepare
 8
     for this thing.
 9
                  MR. DIXON: I understand.
10
                  MR. HARLOR: I really didn't. I thought
11
     we were going to talk about the issues and me
12
     explaining the issues tonight.
13
                  MR. DIXON: This is a court proceeding
14
     in a sense.
15
                  MR. HARLOR: I did not know that.
16
                  MR. DIXON: And, then, again it is a
17
     court proceeding.
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay.
18
19
                  MR. DIXON: So that's how the City
20
     handles this. So anything that you like in front, we
21
     will have it marked as an exhibit that you presented
22
     to us. Thank you.
23
                  MR. HARLOR: There's all the --
24
                  MR. ZETS: It's your decision. I don't.
```

```
54
 1
                  MR. HARLOR: Yeah. Yeah, that's fine.
 2
     That's just the lady that started all this, it's an
 3
     apology to --
 4
                  MR. DIXON: Let's just go ahead and mark
 5
     it in as an exhibit and then we'll take a look at it.
 6
                (Discussion Held Off the Record.)
 7
              (EXHIBIT MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION.)
 8
                  MR. ZETS: It will be -- it's marked as
 9
     Exhibit I. There are five e-mails, another document
10
     that has outline of some material, Ohio Department of
11
     Agriculture, and Animal Rescue for Dogs, a
12
     certification from the Department of Agriculture for
13
     Charlie's Wish Animal Rescue, Incorporated, date
14
     issued December 31st, 2015. There's a Department of
15
     Treasury, IRS document dated July 6th, 2015. It all
16
     has to do with 501 (3)(c) exemption of some sort, and
17
     that is Exhibit I.
18
                  MR. DIXON: If you could, we'll just
19
     take a few seconds as a Board to take a look at this
20
     Exhibit.
21
                  MR. HARLOR: Is there going to be a
22
     decision made tonight? Is that the way the Board
23
     works?
24
                  MR. DIXON: Most likely, yes.
```

```
1
                  MR. HARLOR: I would like to be
 2
     represented by an attorney before -- I mean, I'll
 3
     sell the building if that's what you guys want to do.
 4
                  MR. DIXON: Hold on. Just get -- let us
 5
     take a look at this.
 6
                  (A short recess was taken.)
 7
                  MR. HARLOR: I don't know if everybody
8
     realizes the horrid conditions --
9
                  MR. DIXON: We're still in court here,
10
     so just --
11
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay.
12
                  MR. DIXON: We're taking a brief break
13
     here.
14
                  MR. ZETS: But not off the record break.
15
            (Inaudible Discussion amongst the Board.)
16
                  MR. ZETS: Hey, guys. I said it's not
17
     off the record break. You can't talk unless she can
18
    pick it up.
19
                  MR. DIXON: Okay. When we were looking
20
     at Exhibit I, the one thing that was kind of mumbled
21
     over here, we apologize, was we were unclear of the
22
     Fairfield County Humane Society looking at something
23
     in Licking County, but later in one of the things we
24
     seen --
```

```
1
                  MR. HARLOR: I can answer that.
                                                   There
 2
     is a humane officer that is at the Licking County
 3
     Humane Society. The main officer gets paid, like,
 4
     $25 a month or $40 a month in some areas, and
 5
     according to our attorney, Jeff Holland, he said the
 6
     guy had no right to walk in, under law, he had no
 7
     right to walk in.
 8
                  MR. DIXON: But he -- he works for
 9
     Licking County?
10
                  MR. HARLOR: No, he didn't. He actually
11
     didn't. This was part of the Sherri Jolley thing.
12
                  MR. DIXON: Hold on just a second.
13
                  MR. FULTON: If I may, prior to
14
     July 1st, 2016, the City of Pataskala did not
15
     contract with Licking County and used Fairfield
16
     County. For whatever reason, I wasn't aware of the
17
     reasoning behind that, but as of July 1st, 2016, the
18
     City of Pataskala has contracted with Licking County
19
     Humane Society.
20
                  MR. DIXON: Okay. Thank you.
21
                  MR. HARLOR: According to what I
22
     understand, they didn't want to pay the fee that
23
     Licking County charged to come out there.
24
                  MR. DIXON: Okay. I think we're all
```

```
1
     clear on that.
 2
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay.
 3
                  MR. DIXON: Do you have anything else to
 4
     present to us?
 5
                  MR. HARLOR: Other than I had no idea
 6
     that this was the way it was going to be. I was
 7
     trying to comply with the complaints around there. I
 8
     think I explained to these guys that gaps, which will
 9
     take about five workers to take tractors and mowers
10
     on to the backyard, that's all the gate. I just
11
     didn't get it done. It's going to take me a couple
12
     days to do everything -- to do that. And, you know,
13
     if you guys want me to sell the building to get out
14
     of this, let the shelter slaughter animals, I'll get
15
     out of it. Thank you.
16
                  MR. DIXON: We have the right to ask
17
```

questions now, correct?

MR. ZETS: Correct.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

MR. DIXON: Okay. Board, do you have any questions?

MS. HASSON: You had said something about needing a room addition, so that the handicap can come in, has that been completed or started or --MR. HARLOR: No, it is an addition to

```
the side of the building which is a proposed addition, and I came here to ask for a variance of a lot line and none of this stuff was mentioned at that time. What date was this, Scott?
```

MR. FULTON: November 15 of -- the side yard setback variance was approved by the Board of Zoning and Appeals for the proposed addition.

MR. HARLOR: Now, we're on to the things that -- the carport that is at the building is on the neighbor's lot is about 5-foot, which would have happened probably in the 1960s, that's throwing the whole thing off, is where the lot line is, but I figured out where the lot line is. We're probably going to have to survey if -- I'm not adding on the building if it doesn't pass. I'm going to sell the building and get out of this.

MS. RHODEBACK: I would like to go back to the conditional use application. No. 2,

"Installation of a new sign that is 'more modern' and 'nice looking.'" Is there a budget or any plans to have that completed and what's the time line?

MR. HARLOR: What's -- it is the -- did

I -- I don't know if you guys got this.

MS. RHODEBACK: Yes.

```
59
 1
                  MR. DIXON: You can show us that.
 2
                  MR. HARLOR: It's made --
 3
                  MS. RHODEBACK: But that's not --
 4
     that's -- you're not able to put that one up
 5
     because --
 6
                  MR. HARLOR: No.
 7
                  MS. RHODEBACK: -- photo is not --
 8
                  MR. HARLOR: No. No, they will not.
 9
                  MS. RHODEBACK: -- but for the Charlie's
10
    Wish Foundation. Was there a plan or budget --
11
                  MR. HARLOR: I was never --
12
                  MR. ZETS: Wait, wait. Let her finish
13
     the question.
14
                  MR. HARLOR: I understand. I'm sorry.
15
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Is there a plan or
16
    budget to complete the sign as of the conditional use
17
     application No. CU-16-005, No. 2 for the staff
18
     review?
19
                  MR. HARLOR: It's plated. It's done. I
20
     just can't put it up.
21
                  MS. RHODEBACK: No, that's not the
22
     correct sign, sir. You can't put that one up per the
23
    variance.
24
                  MR. HARLOR: I'm not putting a sign out
```

```
60
 1
     that says Animal Rescue because my dogs is not there.
 2
     I will not do that.
 3
                  MS. RHODEBACK: No. 3, "Installation of
 4
     a 6-foot privacy fence on the back of the property."
 5
     What's the time line of completion on that?
 6
                  MR. HARLOR: In the next, probably, two
 7
     weeks at the most. I have to fill in under the
 8
     fence --
 9
                  MS. RHODEBACK: All right. But --
10
                  MR. HARLOR: -- to patch the wood.
11
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Do you have it scheduled
12
     with a public contractor or is this self?
13
                  MR. HARLOR: I'm doing it.
14
                  MS. RHODEBACK: And the budget? Do you
15
     have a budget in mind?
16
                  MR. HARLOR: I already got the
17
     materials.
                  MS. RHODEBACK: I'm just trying to get
18
19
     the details of --
20
                  MR. HARLOR: I got everything.
21
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Okay. And there are --
22
     No. 6, "Installation of the separating areas of the
23
     yard for dogs of different sizes", is there a --
24
                  MR. HARLOR: When we would open Bark
```

```
Avenue --
```

2 MR. ZETS: No, let her ask her question 3 completely.

MR. HARLOR: I thought she was done.

MS. RHODEBACK: Do you have written or a schematic of what your intentions are in the backyard to separate the canines?

MR. HARLOR: No, not right now. We go through a lot of stuff, but we think it will work and it doesn't work so we try to vary and make it work.

MS. RHODEBACK: Have you contacted a professional dogs rescuer that has had a successful dog rescue for professional services?

MR. HARLOR: I know a lot of people that are in this.

MS. RHODEBACK: But do you have -- are you mentoring under another one or are you just haphazardly --

MR. HARLOR: No, if I have a question, I can get Dr. Messer, the Columbus City vet, out, and I can get other people that we're -- we had different relationships with.

MS. RHODEBACK: Do you have a dog rescue that you can give us the name of that you're

```
1
     mentoring with or working with?
 2
                  MR. HARLOR: Not so much a rescue. I
 3
     mean, we got rescues we're in contact with, but I
 4
     have people that are very professional in this
 5
     organization -- or in this business. They -- I mean,
 6
     Dr. Messer is one of the main people. I'm on the
 7
     Animal Response Team with him, and if -- he's been
 8
     out. He's been out. Like, what do we do? What do
     you think of this? What type of a door should I
 9
10
     install? What should I do with this, and he'll come
11
     out. He will come out and help me.
12
                  MS. RHODEBACK: And No. 8, as far as
13
     cleaning the yard and the play areas, do you have a
14
     written schedule of when that's completed every week?
15
                  MR. HARLOR: I pretty much do it daily.
16
                  MS. RHODEBACK: And you're doing all the
17
     work yourself. No one shares --
18
                  MR. HARLOR: Not all of it, but a lot of
19
     it.
20
                  MS. RHODEBACK: And what is that
21
     schedule?
22
                  MR. HARLOR: I go out with my Pooper
23
     Scooper and walk around and scoop poop.
24
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Daily?
```

```
1
                  MR. HARLOR: I try to do it every day,
 2
     if it's --
 3
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Every day?
 4
                  MR. HARLOR: -- if it's raining, things
 5
     vary, but, I mean, if it's raining hard, it's kind of
 6
     hard to go out there with a rake and pick it up, but
 7
     it's clean. I mean, it's not laying around.
 8
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Thank you.
 9
                  MR. DIXON: One thing I've kind of was
10
     looking for clarity on is it seems we are dealing
11
     with two separate businesses here?
12
                  MR. HARLOR: Right.
13
                  MR. DIXON: And when you got the
14
     conditional use, which business did you get the
15
     conditional use for?
16
                  MR. HARLOR: It mainly was Bark Avenue
17
     Hotel, but we were going to do the rescue and Laura
     has taken off with this more than I wanted to. She's
18
19
     the partner in this. She's taken off with the rescue
20
     to the point where it's almost an obsession with her.
21
     She spent $4,600 on a 13 year-old dog. He had his
22
     leg amputated, ended up sick, and he got his gall
23
     bladder taken out of him. I mean, he comes back and
24
     forth. I mean, it's kind of crazy.
```

MR. DIXON: Okay. So, the conditional use you asked for you're saying it was kind of for both? I think I do have a question for Mr. Fulton real quick.

The conditional use from 2012, was that for either business or was it just for a rescue or just for a daycare?

MR. FULTON: It was for both because with the NAICS number, under that number there's a list of uses, and animal rescue is included with kennels, boarding, et cetera.

MR. DIXON: The name he had that under, though, on the conditional use was? Did he have one?

MR. FULTON: I don't know that one was

indicated in the conditional use application.

MR. DIXON: Why are we considering him as one business and not the other one?

MR. FULTON: The Charlie's Wish is the only operation functioning at that location. Bark Avenue, while we have a sign and things, is not functioning at that location. So moving forward, the conditional use is for both because he was approved for both, so the conditional use considered tonight is for both because it's under that NAICS number,

which includes all the other usages, and both are under that same number.

MR. DIXON: Okay.

MR. HARLOR: Can I speak?

MR. DIXON: Hold on. We might have one more. Go ahead. Go ahead with your comment. Go ahead.

MR. HARLOR: The functionality of the building, I mean, I don't know how many people have been by there, but it sits like 6-foot off the ground, almost all of this building. We would need to add the side of the building on with -- which is going to be approximately 24 by 40 with the length of the angle. We asked for its length of the building, that's why I came in here and spent 300 bucks for a variance of the lot line, which there's nothing there except for low spots that AEP owns, and that was going to be completed, and, then, Bark Avenue Hotel would be open. Hopefully, Scott will let us put the sign out and --

The goal here -- and Laura did put the cart before the horse. The goal here was to make some money and support the rescue with the money that we made. I have boarded dogs for people there, not

```
1
     many, once, twos, every once in a while. A lot of
 2
     them are dogs that we had rescued and were adopted
 3
     out and they bring them back to us, and I use that
 4
     money to buy dog food for the rescue dogs, so to a
 5
     point without a sign, I'm kind of doing Bark Avenue
 6
     Hotel, not for anyone to put the sign up.
 7
                  MR. DIXON: Steve, do you have anything?
 8
                  MR. VALENTINE: No, I don't have
9
     anything.
10
                  MR. DIXON: Is there any other questions
11
     from the Board?
12
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Is there a budget for 24
13
    by 40 foot addition?
14
                  MR. HARLOR: Yeah.
15
                  MS. RHODEBACK: And has it been surveyed
16
     and construction plans been made?
17
                  MR. HARLOR: The guy finally came back
18
     out -- and I know Scott was kind of aggravated, but I
```

MR. HARLOR: The guy finally came back out -- and I know Scott was kind of aggravated, but I do trust this guy. He took on a big thing, like, he for -- lumber at -- with a lot of buildings, and he said, I'll give this to you as soon as I can. But I'm going to pay it myself to get this installed.

MR. DIXON: Any other questions from the Board?

19

20

21

22

23

(No Response.)

MR. DIXON: Mr. Harlor, any other

3 comments?

MR. HARLOR: No, I did not know this was going to be what it is tonight. I would have had Mr. Holland here to speak as to what happened with that. Nobody really told me it was going to be like a courtroom type of thing. I thought I was going to try to comply.

Did you ever really tell me what it was like? I mean, this is like a courtroom.

MR. FULTON: Well, typically, the BZA hearings are quasi-judicial by nature.

MR. HARLOR: Okay.

MR. FULTON: So when I said, you know, there'll be a hearing to consider the revocation of the conditional use, there wasn't, "well, what does that mean?" "How does the process go?" I didn't know that you didn't know, so there was --

MR. HARLOR: I did not know, so from a standpoint of me not having our attorney, which you saw his communication on the Sherri Jolley thing, I don't think I was fairly told what was going to happen tonight, that's just my opinion of what's

```
1
     going on. I thought it was going to be that I comply
 2
     with this and, you know, where are we. I didn't call
 3
    Mr. Blake for defense because it's not done, so --
 4
                  MR. DIXON: All right. Are you all
 5
     done?
 6
                  MR. HARLOR: Yes.
                                     Thank you.
 7
                  MR. DIXON: Thank you. Mr. Zets?
 8
                  MR. ZETS: Yes, sir?
9
                  MR. DIXON: As a -- what's our options
10
     as a Board tonight as far as revoking it, not
11
     revoking it? What is -- what is our -- has he been
12
     given enough notice to provide legal counsel?
13
                  MR. ZETS: I believe he was given the
14
     notice that was required. He has been given multiple
15
     letters, and the last letter sent by Mr. King, he
16
     actually said that there would be a hearing, and I
17
    believe Scott's explanation is exactly accurate. BZA
18
    hearings are quasi-judicial by nature. I mean,
19
     they're really not -- you don't conduct them as
20
     formally as you were sitting in a formal courtroom
21
     with Judge Marbley, but you're also maybe not as
22
     informal as Planning Comission where they kind of all
23
     talk over each other, and you have those things. So
24
     I believe he was given an opportunity to present I
```

think everything he needed to present.

Quite honestly, I think when he said what he thought today was, actually is what it was. We talked about whether or not he met the eight conditions, and he was able to explain why he believed he did or did not meet them and the Board had questions on it. Although maybe the process was a little more formal than I believe he thought, actually, we did exactly what he thought was going to do, that is explain why -- to come here tonight to explain why he was complying or why he wasn't.

I think the Board -- I always say that the Board's motion should be an affirmative because it gets very confusing, so it should always be, you know, a motion -- you know, a motion to revoke the conditional use then I'm thinking in the mind of my vote is to revoke it or not to revoke. I think if you do it in a negative, it's two double negatives, and it gives you a clue to what you are really voting on. But that's completely up to you, but that's why I think the motion would be motion to revoke to -- or revoke the conditional use that was granted January 2nd, 2012. The application number is 2012-004.

70 1 MR. DIXON: All right. Thank you. 2 MR. ZETS: You should have the motion --3 you should have some discussion so the record is 4 clear as to why the Board actually wants to make that 5 decision and, then, take a vote. 6 MR. DIXON: Okay. 7 MR. HARLOR: Can I ask another question? 8 MR. DIXON: Come up -- come up in front 9 of the --10 MR. HARLOR: Okay. I know it's on the 11 record from earlier, which I assumed that all this 12 was created by this lady name Sherri Jolley. Are 13 their names of who reported this stuff? Do you have 14 names? I mean, I know her, but --15 MR. FULTON: It's in the Staff Report. 16 Everything that we received is in the Staff Report. 17 MR. HARLOR: Are there names? MR. FULTON: Yes. 18 19 MR. HARLOR: Am I able --20 MR. FULTON: You were sent a link to the 21 Staff Report. MR. HARLOR: I didn't know that was in 22 23 there. There are names, probably two?

MR. FULTON: Without finding exactly

```
71
 1
     where it is, yes, there is names associated with the
 2
     complaint.
 3
                  MR. HARLOR: Okay. Just -- can I get --
 4
     I can look at those?
 5
                  MS. PAXTON: You were sent it in an
 6
     e-mail.
 7
                  MR. HARLOR: Because I want those names
8
    because nothing was found in those.
9
                  MR. DIXON: Yeah, it's -- we're actually
10
     looking at one through eight here, more than we are
     of how you run your kennel, and who saying what about
11
12
     it. We're looking more of about what it -- what it
13
     looks like and what you said you're going to do, what
14
     you haven't done tonight.
15
                  MR. HARLOR: But I would like those
16
     names and I would like a transcript of this --
17
                  MR. FULTON: Uh-huh.
18
                  MR. HARLOR: -- if I can get that.
19
                  MR. FULTON: Uh-huh.
20
                  MR. DIXON: The Board if I -- I'll
21
     entertain a motion.
22
                  MR. VALENTINE: Well, I move to approve
     the revocation of conditional use per Section 1215.09
23
24
     of the Pataskala Code for application CU-16-005.
```

1 MR. DIXON: Do I have a second? 2 MS. HASSON: I second that. 3 MR. DIXON: I have a second. Do we have 4 some discussion as to why? 5 MS. HASSON: I think that the program is 6 wonderful. I think what he's trying to do is great, 7 but I think he needs to try to set some time aside 8 and the money aside to get this done, and, then, come 9 back in and say, okay, now, I'm ready to start this 10 business, and look at reopening at the time that he 11 actually is ready to do it. 12 None of my decision is based on any of 13 the complaints that anybody made. I'm just looking 14 at you had four and a half years to do eight things 15 that they asked of you, and you still have things 16 that aren't done. And, then, you still need to do 17 room addition to meet on. I just think that some of 18 these things needs to be done, and, then, look at a 19 business --20 MR. HARLOR: The room addition is not 21 going to happen if this is done tonight. 22 MR. DIXON: Sir, we can't have anymore

```
73
 1
                  MR. HARLOR: It's going up for sale.
 2
                  MS. HASSON: And so that is one of the
 3
     reasons it should be revoked until he can get it to a
 4
     place that's good.
 5
                  MS. RHODEBACK: And I feel like a better
 6
     business plan and a budget, if you're coming back in
 7
     for another conditional use application, that the
 8
     budget, and a time line of completion -- completing
 9
     any of the projects, two through seven -- or two
10
     through six -- I'm sorry -- would have to be
11
     documented for any further conditional uses.
12
                  MR. DIXON: Anything else, Board?
13
                  (No response.)
14
                  MR. DIXON: All right. The motion on
15
     the table is to approve the revocation. Roll call
16
     when ready please.
17
                  MS. PAXTON: Ms. Rhodeback?
18
                  MS. RHODEBACK: Abstain.
19
                  MS. PAXTON: Mr. Dixon?
20
                  MR. DIXON: Yes.
21
                  MS. PAXTON: Ms. Hasson?
22
                  MS. HASSON: Yes.
23
                  MS. PAXTON: Mr. Valentine?
24
                  MR. VALENTINE: Yes.
```

```
74
                  MR. DIXON: We did vote to revoke your
1
    conditional use, and we wish you luck in the future.
2
3
4
                   (Thereupon the hearing concluded at 8:03
5
    p.m. on Tuesday, July 12, 2016.)
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```

CERTIFICATE I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings taken by me in this matter on Tuesday, July 12, 2016, and carefully compared with my original stenographic notes. Registered Professiona Reporter Will OHIO